



**MINUTES OF THE SPRINGDALE PLANNING COMMISSION WORK MEETING
ON WEDNESDAY AUGUST 7, 2019 AT 5:00PM
AT SPRINGDALE TOWN HALL, 118 LION BLVD., SPRINGDALE, UTAH.**

Meeting convened at 5:00 PM

MEMBERS PRESENT: Chair Mike Marriott, Suzanne Elger, Allan Staker, Joe Pitti, Jack Burns, Tyler Young

ABSENT: J. Treacy Stone Representing Zion National Park

ALSO PRESENT: Director of Community Development Tom Dansie, Associate Planner Sophie Frankenburg, and Town Clerk Darci Carlson recording. Please see attached list for attendees signed in.

Approval of the Agenda: Motion made by Joe Pitti to approve the agenda; seconded by Allan Staker.

Staker: Aye

Elger: Aye

Marriott: Aye

Pitti: Aye

Young: Aye

Motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Dansie reported the Town Council held a work meeting yesterday to discuss the development incentive ordinance. The Council had gratefully acknowledged the work of the Planning Commission and understood the complexity of this ordinance. In addition to accepting the bulk of the recommendations, the Council decided to retain the incentives available through the Moderate-Income Housing Development Overlay Zone, and the building size increases allowed in both the Central Commercial and Village Commercial Zones. Final action on the amendments would be considered in the upcoming August 14th Town Council meeting.

Ms. Carlson provided an update on the primary election. At this point, the Town had a 48% return. Ballots must be postmarked by August 12th or returned to Town Hall by August 13th at 5:00pm in order to be counted. Three counting judges were approved by the Council.

A. Information/Discussion/Non-Action Items

1. Approval of a date change for the Planning Commission Work Meeting from Wednesday, October 2nd to Tuesday, October 1st: Mr. Dansie explained both he and Associate Planner Sophie Frankenburg would be attending a planning conference in Salt Lake City on October 2nd therefore they asked if the October work meeting date could be rescheduled. The Commission agreed to make the adjustment however Mr. Young indicated he could not attend.

Motion by Suzanne Elger to change the Planning Commission work meeting from Wednesday, October 2nd to Tuesday, October 1st; seconded by Allan Staker.

Staker: Aye

Elger: Aye

Marriott: Aye

Pitti: Aye

Young: Aye

Motion passed unanimously.

B. Information/Discussion/Non-Action Items

1. Twenty-minute open Commission discussion: The intent of this agenda item was to allow Commissioners an opportunity to discuss general town-wide topics and not specific properties, projects or people. If a specific item was to be discussed it must be noticed on an agenda to allow applicants/property owners due process.

Mr. Burns arrived at the meeting at 5:10pm.

Mr. Staker noted it was reported Springdale was the least affordable place to live in Utah. According to the media account, the ratio of median income to housing costs were the highest in the state despite the Town's efforts. Mr. Staker questioned what those efforts were.

- Mr. Dansie explained the Town had attempted to address affordable housing through the Red Hawk Apartments and in the private market with allowances for rental of accessory dwelling units (ADUs) and the Cottage Housing Development Overlay. Some solutions were met with more success than others, but the Town was still struggling.
- The Town was in process of developing a Community Stakeholder Group on housing. Additionally, the Council budgeted money to hire a housing consultant to provide strategies that will more effectively look at the affordable housing issue.

Mr. Burns noted only 76 cities in the state were considered affordable.

- Mr. Young said it wasn't just Utah but a nation-wide crisis.

Mr. Marriott asked if ADUs had contributed anything measurable to the Town.

- Mr. Dansie knew there were several in the community but said they were a small contributor to the overall needs.

Mr. Pitti asked about income restrictions at the Red Hawk Apartments.

- The apartments were affordable for 99 years. Rents were calculated as a percentage of area median income.

Given the limited area in Town, property values were high. Some standards, such as lot size, were self-imposed, which if changed could open up more area.

- Mr. Pitti said affordable meant different things to different people.
- Mr. Young said the Commission should consider changes to lot sizes in different zones. Affordable housing was an issue for the next generation across the state.

Mr. Staker asked if it was known the percentage of people who drove up the hill to work in Town.

- Mr. Dansie said this data would likely be part of the consultant's study. The Town would engage a consultant in the fall with a final report due late spring, early summer.
- The Council agreed discussion of housing should wait until the consultant study was done.

In recent discussion with residents, Mr. Young indicated many expressed a desire for more green space. Other cities had raised funds then worked with private property owners on conservancy agreements to keep space open.

- As part of the budget, the Town set aside \$10,000 per year into an open space preservation fund. Mr. Dansie said the only way for the Town to amass enough money to purchase open space was through a bond. This year the Town budgeted for a bond consultant who would determine the community's appetite for voter-approved bond funding.

2. Outdoor Lighting Regulation revisions: In their last work meeting the Commission discussed changes to outdoor lighting to clarify standards and more effectively achieve the goals in the ordinance.

Mr. Dansie highlighted recent changes to the proposed language which included:

- Due to limits in commercial availability for pole-mounted, parking lot, and bollard lights, Mr. Dansie suggested the definition of full cut-off fixtures be changed so only building-mounted lights needed to meet the enhanced 2" recessed standard.

- Vending machines, gas pumps and ATM machines must be either entirely screened or shielded, have only 15% of the area illuminated, or have no more than one and a half square feet illuminated.
- Changes in standards for the lumens allowed per acre would apply to new construction and to reconstruction, remodels and additions that impacted 50% or more of the building.
- Flags could only be down-illuminated.
- Allowance for low-voltage, solar pathway lighting was added back into the ordinance.

The proposed changes were not part of an amortization schedule and would only affect new or changed lights.

As reference for the Commission, Mr. Dansie compiled an assessment of lumens per acre for a number of properties in Town. Most surveyed were in the 30,000 – 40,000 lumens per acre range. The International Dark Sky Association (IDA) recommended 25,000 lumens per acre.

- For future development applications, a lighting plan must contain manufacturer's details indicating how many lumens were emitted from each light.
- Existing light calculations would be the responsibility of the property owner.

The Commission discussed the ordinance language.

The Town Council directed staff to start the process to obtain dark sky certification through the International Dark Sky Association. One requirement was for the Town to have an outdoor lighting ordinance that contained provisions related to specific light color standards and lumens per acre.

- Mr. Burns applauded this effort and indicated Zion National Park was also working on an application to become night sky certified.

The Commission considered the lighting standards for vending machines, gas station pumps, and ATM machines. As drafted, Mr. Dansie acknowledged this was a strict requirement.

- Concern was raised that changes could create an unreasonable burden for business owners. Staff would research if these standards were feasible.

The Commission discussed lumen count per acre.

- At the initial review stage, an applicant must demonstrate they were in compliance with standards. Afterward, when lights were changed out, the Town did not have resources to monitor. Complaints would trigger follow-up and possible enforcement action.

An educational component would help the community understand why changes were being recommended. Mr. Burns said it was important to recognize what made Springdale unique, including the dark night sky. He hoped people would adopt an attitude it was the right thing to do but also that it was good for business.

- Mr. Pitti commented the street light retrofits were a positive change and a good illustration of what the Town was trying to achieve.

At this point, Mr. Marriott was unsure about the 30,000 per acre lumen limit.

- Ms. Elger asked if there was guidance as to what the cap should be.
- The IDA had a recommendation of lumens per acre; however, a specific number was not needed to achieve dark sky certification status.

If the Town adopted 25,000 lumens per acre as the limit, Mr. Staker noted nearly every commercial property would be out of compliance.

- Mr. Pitti suggested the Commission recommend 30,000 lumens per acre and if determined to be problematic the Town could increase the limit. It would be harder to start higher and dial it back.
- Ms. Elger agreed and said 30,000 was a good compromise given the limited area in Town.

The Commission was generally satisfied with the ordinance language and decided to move it to public hearing.

3. Transient Lodging Ordinance revisions: After a number of work meetings, the Commission had agreed on classifications for types of transient lodging and design standards for new lodging facilities. What remained was a recommendation on the ultimate amount and pace of lodging development in Springdale. The staff report outlined a number of different strategies for the Commission to consider.

As more uses converted to lodging, the Town was losing important non-lodging uses such as housing, retail, galleries, and restaurants.

Mr. Pitti noted that Bed & Breakfast should be added back into the ordinance as an identified lodging classification. Mr. Dansie agreed.

The bigger issue for Mr. Burns was determining what Springdale wanted to be recognized for. He asked when enough lodging was enough compared to other commercial and residential uses.

Ms. Elger wanted to work on transient lodging ordinance revisions but found it frustrating when illegal nightly rentals were in prohibited zones. She was unsure the current definition of TLU adequately captured all the scenarios but acknowledged something should be done to manage lodging despite many pieces being interconnected.

Mr. Young was primarily concerned with loss of other uses. Rather than a hard cap, Mr. Young favored linking lodging uses with non-lodging uses such that new lodging developments would need to also contain a retail and/or housing component. He expressed a cap would be irresponsible due to implications to the Town's budget.

Mr. Pitti said an increase in lodging units put stress on the Town's infrastructure. He preferred a ratio cap between residences and hotel rooms. He did not think a lodging overlay zone was good unless it could be isolated to commercial zones; however, he liked the idea of lodging contributing other uses.

- The current ratio was approximately 1:2 with 1,200 lodging rooms to 550-600 residences.

Mr. Staker was only in favor of a cap if the Town identified a problem to solve. That said, he was unsure what problem was being solved by establishing a limit on lodging. The Town had no business dictating whether a property owner built a hotel or not. Springdale was a gateway community to a National Park and stopping the flow of people was not feasible. Given the number of daily visitors, Mr. Staker said there were not enough rooms. The Town should be allowed to build-out with the ordinances in place.

Of the possible strategies presented, Ms. Elger felt establishing a cap was most difficult. She preferred revising density standards and incentivizing lodging development to include retail. Ms. Elger was not in favor of an overlay zone.

Mr. Marriott was open to the idea of a cap however he was trying to understand the nature of the problem. Given the magnitude of this topic, Mr. Marriott suggested the Planning Commission turn to the Town Council for a directive. He acknowledged some people were concerned with the pace of lodging however others believed it had slowed down. If a cap was established, it should not be exclusive to lodging.

Mr. Burns asked if there would be value in surveying the community to help guide the conversation.

- Mr. Pitti felt a survey would yield similar responses to what the Town had received before. There was enough evidence the community was interested in stopping hotel growth. He agreed with Mr. Marriott the Commission should poll the Council to understand if they were on board moving ahead with this topic.
- If hotel growth was stopped, Ms. Elger asked what the Town wanted to see instead. Answering this question would help guide their focus to things the community wanted.

The Commission agreed to get feedback from the Council so there was clarity moving forward.

Motion to adjourn at 7:13pm made by Allan Staker; seconded by Tyler Young.

Staker: Aye

Elger: Aye

Marriott: Aye

Burns: Aye

Pitti: Aye

Motion passed unanimously.



Darci Carlson, Town Clerk

APPROVAL: 

DATE: 9-18-19

A recording of the public meeting is available by contacting the Town Clerk's Office. Please call 435-772-3434 or via email at springdale@infowest.com for more information.